

MEDIUM-TERM FINANCIAL PLAN

SAVING PROPOSAL TEMPLATE

DIRECTORATE:	Communities
--------------	-------------

SERVICE AREA:	Public Protection – Public Open Space CCTV
---------------	--

1. GENERAL INFORMATION

SAVING PROPOSAL:	Cessation of Public Open Space CCTV coverage in villages/areas utilising BT fibre connections in order to generate MTFP savings for 2020/21. Removal of 26 cameras and associated signage, disconnection of BT Fibre.
------------------	---

BUDGET AREA:	CCTV Control Room
--------------	-------------------

TOTAL BUDGET FOR THIS AREA:	£429,739	% OF TOTAL BUDGET IN SAVINGS PROPOSAL:	6.74%*
-----------------------------	----------	--	--------

TOTAL SAVING:	£24,000 (£24K in 20/21 with £5k to follow in 21/22 due to 3 month notice requirement)
---------------	---

PLEASE PROVIDE A DESCRIPTION OF HOW THE SAVING WILL BE ACHIEVED:
<p>The BT fibre lines connecting the 26 cameras in village locations will be disconnected resulting in a saving of line rental costs of £29k in total (£24k in 20/21 with £5k to follow in 21/22 due to 3 month notice requirement). The cameras will be retained as possible spares for other locations and/or offered for sale to other providers using similar cameras. There could also be an additional saving in maintenance contract costs in future years. There will be a one off cost to remove the cameras and signage as they cannot remain in situ if not connected, see below.</p> <p>* NB The 6.74% is in addition to other savings put forward of £24,000 in CCTV budget realignment.</p> <p>Camera locations are as follows:-</p> <p>Nelson - 2 cameras Cefn Forest - 3 cameras Llanbradach - 2 cameras Senghenydd - 2 cameras Abertridwr - 4 cameras Graig – Y- Rhacca -1 camera Oakdale -1 camera Pengam Train Station - 6 cameras Trinant -1 camera Crescent Rd Car Park Caerphilly - 4 cameras</p>

2. PUBLIC IMPACT ANALYSIS

PLEASE DESCRIBE HOW THE PROPOSED SAVING COULD **IMPACT UPON THE PUBLIC:**

CONSIDER THE 5 WAYS OF WORKING, IN PARTICULAR, *LONG-TERM* IMPLICATIONS FOR FUTURE GENERATIONS AND *PREVENTATIVE SERVICES*. RECOGNISING THAT SAVINGS MAY SECURE FUTURE PROVISION, OR MAY BE NEEDED TO SECURE PROVISION IN ANOTHER AREA.

Long-term guidance: Consider the importance of balancing short-term needs with the need to safeguard the ability to meet long-term needs.

Prevention guidance: Consider whether the proposed saving is affecting a preventative area that reduces future burdens and supports well-being.

Public open space camera recording and monitoring contributes to crime prevention and detection, public safety, protection of assets such as buildings, community cohesion and management of fear of crime. A short term gain from savings in the CCTV budget could impact on the areas/ communities in the long term. Once the lines and cameras are disconnected they are unlikely to be reconnected if situations/needs change due to the costs involved. Cameras and signs would have to be removed. Budget would be lost, the only future CCTV option would be for temporary short term deployment of mobile 3/4G cameras, if suitable, and currently there are only 4 of these cameras available. The deterrent value of cameras is hard to quantify and will not be truly known until the cameras/lines are removed.

The authority is currently converting all of the county borough's street lanterns to LED and at the same time implementing part night lighting between the hours of midnight and 5.30am. Sufficient lighting is remaining in situ where CCTV cameras are located. If these cameras are removed then lighting levels would be reduced which may be an issue if, in future, the authority wishes to deploy a mobile camera.

If the BT lines and cameras are disconnected i.e. no longer recording, the cameras and signage must be removed. Leaving inactive cameras in situ is not an option as "dummy" cameras promote a false sense of security. This may lead an individual to believe the area is being monitored and any criminal activity will generate an immediate response. Signage might also lead to a false sense of security and potential liability problems if the public believes cameras are monitored at all times and help is on the way if they become victimised.

Police and other enforcement agencies can currently request access to footage associated with crime and anti-social behaviour which will no longer be available after cessation. Live monitoring can also assist with locating and catching perpetrators, finding missing persons etc.

A relatively small saving of £29k could have impacts across the 9 areas where cameras are currently located. Potential impacts are difficult to quantify, but could include increased fear of crime, actual increases in anti-social behaviour or crime, damage to properties. Lack of footage in support of, or in order to prove offences, identify individuals involved. CCTV monitoring can also assist in the protection of emergency services when attending incidents, and supporting police officers when in pursuit of individuals. Operatives are also often asked to help locate missing persons.

The 6 cameras at Pengam park and ride support rail travel and thereby reduced congestion on the roads. Removal of cameras may impact commuters travel decisions. Removal of cameras at Crescent Road Car park in Caerphilly could impact on tourism and plans for developing the area. The parking meters in the latter have been broken into a few times and removal of cameras may lead to an increase in such activity.

An assessment has been carried out of the number of incidents monitored by CCTV operators in the area, number of requests for footage by Gwent Police and the level of crime in the areas as reported on the

Gwent Police Website. The latter relates to a general area and may not be specific to the actual camera location. Some of the cameras affected are in low incident, low crime areas. The deterrent factor however is more difficult to quantify. The cameras were installed initially to deal with specific issues in that area and levels of antisocial behaviour, crime etc change over time.

Details of incidents and monitoring in the camera locations for a 12 month period are shown in the table below.

CCBC CCTV System - BT Cameras only

Incident Data for 01/09/18 to 31/08/19

Area	No. of Cameras	Line Rental Cost	Reported Incidents (inc. Storenet)	Non-Reported Incidents	Police Requests	Retrospective Requests for CCTV	Total	DVD's Burnt	Police.uk website incidents		
									Total by Ward / Area	Camera Area	% in Area
Police HQ Link	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A
Abertridwr	4	£5,643.00	1	3	12	12	28	35		228	34
Caerphilly - Crescent Road Park	4	£1,663.15	1	12	2	1	16				
Cefn Fforest	3	£3,137.73	5	10	4	6	25	4		372	65
Graig y Rhacca	1	£2,615.26	1	0	6	2	9	2		184	0
Llanbradach	2	£3,422.84	0	2	3	8	13	4		318	49
Nelson	2	£2,876.70	1	14	15	13	43	16		332	71
Oakdale	1	£1,320.69	0	2	3	1	6	2		259	40
Pengam Train Station	6	£2,478.55	0	1	1	1	3	0		45	12
Senghenydd	2	£3,348.28	2	4	7	4	17	4		141	32
Trinant	1	£2,810.10	0	1	1	3	5	4		124	10
	26	£29,316.30	11	49	54	51	165	71		2003	313

NB For context and comparison purposes a table has been produced below showing the same type of data for 3 town centre areas for the same time period.

CCBC CCTV System - PSBA Cameras for 3 Largest Systems

Incident Data for 01/09/18 to 31/08/19

Area	No. of Cameras	Line Rental Cost	Reported Incidents (inc. Storenet)	Non-Reported Incidents	Police Requests	Retrospective Requests for CCTV	Total	DVD's Burnt	Police.uk website incidents		
									Total by Ward / Area	Camera Area	% in Area
Bargoed	23	Covered by existing network	29	164	57	49	299	81	828	297	36%
Blackwood	24	Covered by existing network	46	365	230	92	733	93	1072	485	45%
Caerphilly	18	Covered by existing network	18	419	193	100	730	92	690	239	35%
Totals	65		93	948	480	241	1762	266	2590	1021	39%

NB PSBA line rental varies depending on the size of the network connection with some costing £2,500 per annum.

DOES THE PROPOSAL HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO IMPACT MORE GREATLY ON PEOPLE WITH PROTECTED CHARACTERISTICS? (PLEASE TICK) (AGE, DISABILITY, GENDER REASSIGNMENT, MARRIAGE or CIVIL PARTNERSHIP, PREGNANCY AND MATERNITY, RACE, RELIGION or BELIEF, SEX, SEXUAL ORIENTATION)	YES	NO
		*
NB * IF YES, PLEASE COMPLETE AN EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT (EIA) SCREENING. THIS WILL DETERMINE WHETHER A FULL EIA IS NEEDED. FOR FURTHER ADVICE AND GUIDANCE PLEASE SEE THE POLICY PORTAL . SCREENING FORMS AND ANY EIAs WILL NEED TO BE APPENDED TO ALL DECISION REPORTS RELATED TO THE PROPOSED SAVING.		

PLEASE DETAIL ANY CONSULTATION THAT HAS BEEN UNDERTAKEN IN CONSIDERING THIS PROPOSAL. SUMMARISE ANY FEEDBACK RECEIVED.		
CONSIDER THE 5 WAY OF WORKING, IN PARTICULAR, <i>INVOLVEMENT</i> .		
<p>Involvement guidance: Consider whether you have involved people who have an interest in the service area, including service users and potential service users.</p> <p>Annual reviews are required by the Surveillance Camera Commissioner, in order to justify the continued usage of the cameras. Ward Members, police, community safety wardens, community councils etc. where appropriate, are consulted and asked to comment on the continued need in the area. The responses received to the annual reviews all support continued utilisation.</p> <p>A public consultation between January 18 and April 19 on the CCBC website on all public open space CCTV in the county borough had the following results :- 92% believed that CCBC should use CCTV cameras to monitor public open spaces 79% believed that crime and disorder and antisocial behaviour would increase in their areas if cameras were removed. 73% said they felt safer due to the presence of the cameras. 78% felt the clearly visible presence of cameras reduced crime in their area.</p> <p>Further specific consultation on this proposed cut in service will be carried out as part of the draft budget consultation.</p>		
IS FURTHER CONSULTATION REQUIRED BEFORE THIS PROPOSAL CAN BE IMPLEMENTED? (PLEASE TICK) PLEASE SEEK GUIDANCE FROM CORPORATE POLICY, WHO CAN ADVISE ON THE GUNNING PRINCIPLES, IN PLANNING ANY CONSULTATION.	YES	NO
	√	

TAKING ACCOUNT OF THE ABOVE AND THE IMPACT RATING DEFINITIONS, PLEASE INDICATE THE PUBLIC IMPACT RATING APPLICABLE TO THIS SAVING PROPOSAL (PLEASE TICK):				
NIL IMPACT	MINOR IMPACT	MODERATE IMPACT	SIGNIFICANT IMPACT	CRITICAL IMPACT
		*		

3. ORGANISATIONAL IMPACT ANALYSIS

PLEASE DESCRIBE HOW THE PROPOSED SAVING COULD IMPACT UPON THE ORGANISATION AND FUTURE SERVICE PROVISION:
<p>Reduction could impact on crime and antisocial behaviour in the county borough which may lead to increased costs in other areas e.g. damage to assets such as buildings, community cohesion and safety impacts , travel , tourism etc. as detailed above.</p> <p>Removal will also lead to inconsistencies in some areas i.e. some 3G/4G cameras have been located on a permanent basis in village locations i.e. Gelligaer, Riverside Park Newbridge and Phillipstown. Their continued usage may also need to be reviewed in order to justify 3/4G cameras being utilised in areas of most need. Some villages have also been connected to the Public Sector Broadband Aggregation (PSBA) network and will be covered as they were in sight lines of existing PSBA cameras.</p> <p>Alternative connection options were considered in some locations e.g. connecting cameras to other CCBC networks in the area i.e. schools and libraries. This was not viable due to installation costs, impact on network capacity of these buildings and the cost of increasing the size of the network utilised by the buildings.</p>

PLEASE DESCRIBE HOW THE PROPOSED SAVING WILL IMPACT UPON MEMBERS OF STAFF:
<p>Staffing of the CCTV control room is currently kept to a minimum level of one to two depending on the day of the week on day shift, 2 to 3 on afternoons and 2 on nights. Leave and sickness absence reductions on days and afternoons are not usually covered. A minimum staffing of one on days and two on afternoons is maintained. Operators on afternoons, night shift, weekends and Bank holidays also handle the out of hours emergency telephone helpline for the authority (approximately 6000 calls per annum). They also arm , disarm and monitor CCBC sites such as schools , office buildings and CA sites. Their multiple role and already limited staffing levels makes any further reduction unfeasible. A reduction in the number of cameras they monitor could reduce pressure on operators.</p>

NUMBER OF FULL-TIME EQUIVALENT (FTE) STAFF IN BUDGET AREA AFFECTED:	N/A
--	-----

NUMBER OF POSTS IN BUDGET AREA AFFECTED:	
---	--

NUMBER OF POSTS AFFECTED BY THE PROPOSED SAVING:	
---	--

PLEASE SPECIFY HOW THIS WILL BE MANAGED:	HOW MANY POSTS ?
POST(S) ALREADY VACANT:	
VOLUNTARY SEVERANCE:	
RETIREMENT:	
REDEPLOYMENT:	

REDUNDANCY:	
-------------	--

PLEASE PROVIDE DETAILS OF WHEN THIS WILL BE IMPLEMENTED:	
--	--

WILL THE PROPOSED SAVING HAVE AN IMPACT ON ANOTHER DIRECTORATE, SERVICE AREA OR TEAM WITHIN THE COUNCIL? (PLEASE TICK)	YES	NO
	Yes	
WILL THE PROPOSED SAVING HAVE AN IMPACT ON ANOTHER PUBLIC SECTOR PARTNER, OR VOLUNTARY SECTOR PARTNER? (PLEASE TICK)	YES	NO
	Yes	

IF YES, PLEASE CONSIDER THE 5 WAYS OF WORKING, IN PARTICULAR <i>INTEGRATION</i> . DESCRIBE BELOW: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • THE AREA(S) AFFECTED; AND • HOW THE PROPOSED SAVING WILL IMPACT
--

<p>Integration guidance: Consider how the proposal will impact on other service areas, or partners, and their ability to meet their objectives.</p> <p>Community Safety Partnership and Community Safety Wardens. Cameras monitor Community Safety Wardens as requested when patrolling certain areas or responding to incidents. Information from incidents, monitoring assists with data on crime, antisocial behaviour issues in a particular area.</p> <p>Gwent Police & other enforcement agencies, Trading Standards, housing enforcement, insurance etc. . Crime prevention and detection impacts, loss of evidence in support of offences, identification of offenders, loss of protection for emergency services when attending incidents, inability to assist with locating missing persons. Often CCTV monitor potential incidents and prevent the need for Gwent Police to respond unless actually necessary.</p> <p>Property services - Loss of protection/deterrent factor, increase in damage to premises.</p> <p>Park and Ride at Pengam train station, impact on travel choices</p> <p>Crescent Road Car park Caerphilly -tourism and development plans for Caerphilly town centre, potential increase in break ins of parking meters.</p>
--

HAVE ANY OPTIONS BEEN CONSIDERED TO MITIGATE ORGANISATIONAL IMPACT? PLEASE PROVIDE DETAILS OF ANY MITIGATION.
IN ADDITION, CONSIDER THE 5 WAY OF WORKING, IN PARTICULAR, <i>COLLABORATION</i> .

<p>Collaboration guidance: Acting in collaboration with any other service or partner to meet objectives.</p> <p>Community councils could be asked to contribute but there are ongoing costs including maintenance contracts, camera & equipment replacement to keep up with technological developments, electricity charges etc .</p>
--

Increased policing or utilisation of Community Safety Wardens in hotspot areas is not an option, CCTV coverage is already the most cost effective and least resource intensive option.

TAKING ACCOUNT OF THE ABOVE AND THE IMPACT RATING DEFINITIONS, PLEASE INDICATE THE ORGANISATIONAL IMPACT RATING APPLICABLE TO THIS SAVING PROPOSAL (PLEASE TICK):				
NIL IMPACT	MINOR IMPACT	MODERATE IMPACT	SIGNIFICANT IMPACT	CRITICAL IMPACT
		*		

3. LINKS TO POLICY AND CORPORATE OBJECTIVES

DOES THE SAVINGS PROPOSAL LINK TO ANY OF THE FOLLOWING? IF SO, PLEASE SPECIFY AND STATE WHAT THE IMPLICATION MAY BE.		
POLICY AREA	WHAT IS THE LINK?	WHAT WILL BE THE IMPACT?
CORPORATE PLAN and WELL-BEING OBJECTIVES (please state which objectives)	Creating a county borough that supports a healthy lifestyle – fear of crime	Fear of crime levels could increase impacting on health and well-being. Actual crime could increase and detection levels impacted.
STATUTORY DUTIES	S17 Crime & Disorder Act 1998	There is no statutory duty to provide a Public Open Space CCTV system. The Act requires the council in exercising its various functions to have regard to the likely effect on and the need to do all that it reasonably can to prevent crime and disorder in its area including anti social behaviour. Many services across the Council will contribute to this .
WELSH GOVERNMENT GUIDANCE or STRATEGY		

4. RISK(S) AND SENSITIVITIES

HAVE ANY RISKS BEEN IDENTIFIED IN CONNECTION WITH THIS SAVING PROPOSAL? (PLEASE TICK)	YES	NO
	Yes	
IF YES, PLEASE SPECIFY BELOW:		
PLEASE CONSIDER RISK TO SERVICE USERS, LOSS OF PREVENTATIVE SERVICE AND FUTURE IMPACTS, FINANCIAL RISK, RISK TO STATUTORY PERFORMANCE etc.		

Reduction in CCTV provision could impact on crime and antisocial behaviour in the county borough and fear of crime which may lead to increased costs in other areas e.g. damage to assets such as buildings, community cohesion and safety impacts
PLEASE SPECIFY BELOW HOW THESE RISKS/SENSITIVITIES WILL BE MITIGATED?
NOT ALL RISKS CAN BE MITIGATED. SOME MAY NEED TO BE TOLERATED IN THE CONTEXT OF BUDGET PRESSURES.
Main town centres are covered by CCTV cameras connected to the PSBA (Public Sector Broadband Aggregation). Any additional cameras that could be viably connected to the PSBA network have already been completed on an invest to save basis.
Increased policing or utilisation of Community Safety Wardens in hotspot areas is not an option; CCTV coverage is already the most cost effective and least resource intensive option.

5. OTHER RELEVANT INFORMATION

PLEASE USE THIS SECTION TO PROVIDE ANY OTHER RELEVANT INFORMATION WHICH YOU FEEL HAS NOT BEEN CAPTURED.
The level of support for public open space CCTV cameras in these areas is very high, with residents who feel safer, local businesses, ward members and stakeholders such as the police. The latter may see an impact on their service after cessation.

HEAD OF SERVICE: Rob Hartshorn

DATE OF COMPLETION: 6/11/2019